

rnal Kajian Bahasa, Sastra, dan Pengajaran

Volume 8 | Nomor 3 | Tahun 2025 | Halaman 703—716 E-ISSN 2615-8655 | P-ISSN 2615-725X

http://diglosiaunmul.com/index.php/diglosia/article/view/1250

Reproduction of female identity in Indonesian novel *Lelaki Harimau* and its German translation *Tigermann*

Reproduksi identitas perempuan dalam novel Indonesia "Lelaki Harimau" dan terjemahan berbahasa Jermannya "Tigermann"

Cicu Finalia¹, M. Zulfi Abdul Malik^{2,*}, & Tri Bigrit Cleveresty³

^{1,2,3}Universitas Padjadjaran

Jalan Raya Bandung-Sumedang KM 21, Jatinangor, Kabupaten Sumedang, Indonesia

¹Email: c.finalia@unpad.ac.id; Orcid: https://orcid.org/0009-0002-4529-894X

^{2,*}Email: zulfi.malik@unpad.ac.id; Orcid: https://orcid.org/0009-0008-3715-5395

³Email: tri.bigrit@unpad.ac.id; Orcid: https://orcid.org/0000-0002-2916-8590

Article History

Received 14 April 2025 Last revised 4 July 2025 Accepted 27 July 2025 Published 23 August 2025

Keywords

female identity; gender studies; appraisal theory; translation; *Lelaki Harimau* novel.

Kata Kunci

identitas perempuan; kajian gender; teori appraisal; penerjemahan; novel *Lelaki Harimau*.

Read online

Scan this QR code with your smart phone or mobile device to read online.



Abstract

This study aims to explore the reproduction of female identity in the novel *Lelaki Harimau* by Eka Kurniawan and its German translation *Tigermann*. This study focuses on the representation of the identity of the female characters in both versions of the text, differences in attitude, judgment, and affect towards female characters in both versions of the text, and influence of the cultural norms of the target language in the reproduction of female identity in translation. This study employs the qualitative method with the approach of content analysis of both versions of the text. Data is obtained from portions of the texts that describe female characters. The results show that there are significant differences in the representation of female identity between the source text and the target text, caused by different lexical and grammatical choices. The German cultural norms influence the reproduction of female identity. The translator adjusted the gender characteristics and roles to fit the context of the target culture. This finding underlines the importance of gender sensitivity in the translation of literary texts and shows how translation is not only a process of transferring meaning, but it is also a medium that can reproduce gender identity, particularly female identity.

Abstral

Penelitian ini bertujuan untuk mengeksplorasi reproduksi identitas perempuan dalam novel Lelaki Harimau karya Eka Kurniawan dan versi terjemahan bahasa Jermannya Tigermann. Fokus utama penelitian ini adalah: representasi identitas tokoh perempuan dalam kedua versi teks, perbedaan sikap, penilaian, dan afeksi terhadap tokoh perempuan dalam kedua versi teks, dan pengaruh norma-norma budaya bahasa sasaran terhadap reproduksi identitas perempuan dalam penerjemahan. Metode penelitian yang digunakan adalah kualitatif dengan pendekatan analisis isi pada kedua versi teks, yaitu versi bahasa Indonesia dan bahasa Jerman. Data diambil dari segmen-segmen teks yang menggambarkan tokoh perempuan, kemudian identitas perempuan dideskripsikan berdasarkan mitos dan realitas. Hasil penelitian menunjukkan bahwa terdapat perbedaan signifikan dalam representasi identitas perempuan antara teks sumber dan teks sasaran, yang diakibatkan oleh pilihan leksikal dan struktur gramatikal yang berbeda. Norma budaya bahasa Jerman mempengaruhi reproduksi identitas perempuan Penerjemah menyesuaikan karakteristik dan peran gender agar sesuai dengan konteks budaya sasaran. Temuan ini menyoroti pentingnya sensitivitas gender dalam praktik penerjemahan karya sastra dan menunjukkan bagaimana penerjemahan tidak hanya berfungsi sebagai proses alih bahasa, tetapi juga sebagai medium yang dapat mereproduksi identitas gender, khususnya identitas perempuan.

© 2025 The Author(s). Diglosia: Jurnal Kajian Bahasa, Sastra, dan Pengajarannya by Universitas Mulawarman

How to cite this article with APA style 7th ed.

Finalia, C., Malik, M. Z. A., & Cleveresty, T. B. (2025). Reproduction of female identity in Indonesian novel *Lelaki Harimau* and its German translation *Tigermann*. *Diglosia: Jurnal Kajian Bahasa, Sastra, dan Pengajarannya, 8*(3), 703—716. https://doi.org/10.30872/diglosia.v8i3.1250





A. Introduction

Identity and representation of women in literary works play an important role in shaping the public perception towards women's role and position in society. Not only do literary works reflect social realities, but they also help construct gender ideologies, both directly and indirectly. Representations of women in literary texts function as a medium to comprehend how women are perceived in a particular society, and at the same time, they also help shape the society's perspectives towards women (Sari & Rusdiarti, 2024). Cocca (2016) in *Superwomen: Gender, Power and Representation* stated that representations of women in media, including literary texts, are often influenced by the dominance of patriarchy, which assigns women's roles based on established social norms. Literary works have the ability to either strengthen or challenge gender stereotypes and traditional feminine roles, both through their narratives or the exploration of women characters.

In the Indonesian context, works of literature have a long history of portraying characters of women, from characters conforming to patriarchy to those challenging the social limitations imposed upon them. The novel *Lelaki Harimau* by Eka Kurniawan is a literary text that portray the complexity of female identity in a patriarchal society. Not only does this novel presents internal conflicts within their female characters, but it also shows how they have to deal with an external force that attempts to control their lives. In its German translation, *Tigermann*, the representations of female identity undergo various changes to adapt to German linguistic and cultural norms (Sudarmaji et al., 2023). The translation of the novel not only involves language transfer, but also cultural adaptation that poses a significant impact on the reproduction of female identity.

Studies of representations of women in literary texts are often the domain of gender studies, a field that investigates how social constructs of gender roles and identity are represented and maintained in a text. According to Hornscheidt (2003), gender should not only be understood as biological categories, but also as a social construct that is reproduced through language, social interaction, and cultural representations. As such, representations of women in literary texts are inseparable from the social constructs that govern them. Translation of literary texts plays an important role in the reproduction of this gender identity. The translation process not only functions as interlanguage transfers of meaning, but also a vehicle to introduce and recontextualize certain cultural norms, including gender norms.

Translation as a process that involves two different cultural systems requires a deep understanding of cultural contexts in both the source language and the target language (Darmapratiwi & Pratiwi, 2024). In this case, a translator is tasked not with creating a literal translation, but rather he has to understand and adjust the textual meanings to become relevant to and acceptable in a different cultural context. Lombardo & Meier (2014) posited that translation plays a key role in adapting gender representations into a different cultural context, in which the lexical and grammatical choices in the target language are often influenced by the gender norms and ideology prevailing in the society of the target language. In the translation of literary texts, this means that the translator is responsible for either maintaining or even changing the representations of gender identity depending on the target culture, which leads to either reproduction or even modification of female identity in the translated text.

Lelaki Harimau as a novel is deeply rooted in the Indonesian cultural context and contains numerous social and gender aspects unique to the Indonesian society. When this was translated into German as Tigermann, various cultural elements have to be adjusted to become relevant to German readers. McRobbie (2009) in The Aftermath of Feminism explained that culture plays a significant role in shaping social perceptions of gender, and in the context of translation, the translator has to consider cultural differences in order to maintain the relevance of the text in the target culture. In the case of Lelaki Harimau, the egalitarian German cultural norms of gender influence how female identity is reproduced in the translated text, which results in significant differences in the ways woman characters are perceived by either Indonesian readers or German readers.

This article focuses on three main aspects, namely (a) representation of female character identity in the Indonesian novel *Lelaki Harimau* and its German translation *Tigermann*, (b) differences in judgment, affect, and appreciation towards female characters in both versions of the texts, (c) influence of cultural norms in the target language towards the reproduction of female identity in translation. By employing these two approaches, this article aims to examine how female identity is represented and reproduced through language and how the translator plays a role in that process.

Every person has their own perspective in representing a woman. Often, the images of from these various perceptions are taken for granted and considered as the "natural" way of how a woman is portrayed (Rothman, 2016). Representations of women at this point are influenced by both individual and external factors that help shape the concept and idea of a woman in the public imagination (Cavallaro, 2001). Further, the perceptions of how women look, and act are shaped by their surroundings. These perceptions may either be in line or contradict with the prevailing beliefs (Belsey & Moore, 1997).

In literature, women have been represented in a variety of ways. These discursive representations reflect the subjective interpretations offered by writers according to the gender stereotypes in their society that, among others, see women as inferior individuals compared to men. A recurring theme in literature is the depiction of women as sexual objects that fulfill the desires of another character. Sexual objectification occurs when the body, parts of the body, or the sexual function is separated from the personality, reduced into mere instruments, or treated as if those aspects can represent the whole person (Fredrickson & Roberts, 1997). Further, according to the studies by Seidman (1999) and Sommers-Flanagan et al. (1993), sexual objectification occurs when attention is given only to isolated feminine body parts. As such, women are often seen as the object of men's sexual desires, shaped by the male-dominated social norms and sexual stereotypes (Benton, 2015; Calogero, 2012).

The tendency to place women in such a position normalizes their passivity (Aubrey & Frisby, 2011) which in turn contributes to their humanization. This objectification also causes certain negative consequences, including self-objectification and the acceptance of the society's standards on sexual attractiveness. This has taken away basic women's rights as free individuals. A number of studies has been conducted on the attempts to return women's position to their rightful place, using various approaches and analyzing various media, such as music, fiction, poetry, and drama (Addae & Abakah, 2024; Bezdoode, 2024; Lear & Taylor, 2023; Pollali & Sidiropoulou, 2021). In addition, the reproduction of female identity is also conducted using another perspective, such gender studies that emphasize on wider and more inclusive representations (Demissie, 2024; Alshhre, 2024; Silva et al., 2024; Fernández, 2022; Caradeux & Salom, 2013).

Theoretically, this study draws on three main perspectives: translation theory, gender construction, and feminist literary analysis. In the field of translation studies, the concept of cultural translation put forward by scholars such as Bassnett, Lefevere, and Venuti posits that translation is not a neutral linguistic act but a recontextualization process embedded within ideological and cultural power structures (Marais, 2018). Translators, as cultural mediators, inevitably make decisions that reflect dominant norms in the target culture. To understand gender in translation, this study refers to concept of gender performativity as proposed by Butler, in which gender is seen not as a fixed identity but as a discursive construction enacted through language (Jackson, 2004). In literature, this construction often reproduces normative femininity or masculinity depending on socio-cultural context. Translation, therefore, can act as a space where gender identities are either reinforced or transformed. From a feminist perspective, the study builds on the work of Simone de Beauvoir (Kjellgren, 2023) who argued that women are socially constructed as the Other, often represented symbolically as passive, mysterious or dangerous. Feminist literary criticism focuses on how texts reflect, reinforce, or subvert patriarchal ideologies. This framework supports the analysis of how female identity is narrated, judged, and valued differently in source text and target text.

In addition, in order for this study to observe more closely how the judgment, affect, and appreciation towards woman characters are expressed in both the source language and the source text, this study also employs the appraisal approach developed by Martin and Rose (2007). This approach allows this study to observe how the attitude of the woman characters is constructed through lexical and grammatical choices, both in the ST and the TT (Ma & Wang, 2016; Manfredi, 2008; Naganuma, 2008; Thahara & Firdaus, 2014; Wang, 2014). This study identifies differences in the ways the characters are valued, appreciated, or degraded in both versions of the text, and how those acts of affection are expressed. This analysis is important in understanding how the identity is reproduced in literary texts and their translations, and how the role of the translator helps shape gender perception in the target culture.

Given the centrality of affect, judgment, and appreciation in the construction of female identity in both the source and target texts, it is also essential to position this analysis within the broader landscape of literary and translation studies. Previous research on Lelaki Harimau has addressed a range of issues, including the rendering of figurative language (Gustema, 2020), the depiction of sexual harassment (Suhadi, 2023), as well as the translation of women's physical features and body parts using the appraisal framework (Finalia, 2022; Finalia et al., 2019). However, discussions specifically addressing the representation of woman identity in the novel especially in relation to its translated versions—remain scarce. Likewise, although several studies have examined gender representation in Indonesian novels that have been translated into other languages (e.g., Prayogo, 2023; Sugiharti et al., 2022; Thoyyibah & El Milal, 2023; Wulandari, 2021; Yulianeta et al., 2016), they tend to focus on broader feminist readings or narrative strategies rather than the shifts in attitudinal meaning between the source and target texts. This study seeks to fill that gap by focusing on the reproduction of female identity through lexical and grammatical choices in both Lelaki Harimau and its German translation Tigermann. By integrating appraisal theory and the concept of cultural translation, this study offers a novel contribution to the field by demonstrating how translation not only transfers meaning but also actively reshapes gendered subjectivities in accordance with the cultural norms of the target language.

B. Method

This study employs a qualitative research design using a textual analysis approach. The primary data sources are the novel *Lelaki Harimau* by Eka Kurniawan (source text—ST) and its German translation *Tigermann* (target text—TT). These texts serve as the basis for comparative analysis of female character representation across two linguistic and cultural contexts. The data collection process involved a close reading and systematic selection of textual segments that explicitly or implicitly describe the main female characters. These include Maharani, Laila, and Nuraeni, as they appear prominently in both the ST and the TT. The selected text segments were chosen based on thematic relevance to Simone de Beauvoir's concept of myth and reality. In this context, the myth includes portrayals of women as the Other, as passive, or mysterious beings, and as symbols within patriarchal narratives. The reality, on the other hand, includes depictions of women's lived experiences—particularly aspects of oppression, resistance, injustice, sexualization, and emotional agency.

Once relevant text segments were identified, a two-tiered analysis was conducted: (1) Content analysis based on de Beauvoir's Framework: Each segment was classified according to myth-related or reality-related themes. For instance, a passage portraying a woman as a seductive figure without agency would be coded as myth—sexual objectification, whereas a passage showing female struggle or resistance would be classified as reality—oppression or reality—liberation; (2) Appraisal theory (Martin & Rose, 2007a): The selected text segments were then analyzed using the appraisal framework, which focuses on three subsystems of attitude (affect, judgement, appreciation). Each appraisal item (specific word or phrase) was identified and coded in both the ST and TT. The analysis aimed to uncover patterns of lexical choices that reflect differences in the portrayal, emotional tone, or evaluative stance toward female characters between the two versions.

Finally, findings from both analytical tiers were compared the ST and TT to determine how the reproduction of female identity shifts in translation, and to identify cultural influences that emerge through linguistic and evaluative differences.

C. Results and Discussion

The result of the analysis of the reproduction of female characters' identity in the novel *Lelaki Harimau* and its German translation *Tigermann* is obtained through the representation of the identity of the female characters in both TSS and TSA, difference in attitude (judgment, affect, and appreciation) towards these characters in both versions, identification of translation aspects that show attempts at significant reproduction of female identity, as well as the influence of cultural norms in the source culture towards the reproduction of female identity in the source text.

1. Representation of Female Characters in Both ST and TT

In the ST, the female characters are portrayed as being quite complex, reflecting both myth and reality. Myth refers to the idealized image of women or demonized by the patriarchal society. In myth, women are often portrayed as the Other, as a passive object, and as a source of danger or seduction. Women are often measured and valued using men's standards, and their roles are often limited within the domestic scope.

The portion of the narrative that depicts Maharani in both the ST and the TT shows how the society build a social construct on women.

ST: ... ia secantik gadis-gadis dekorasi guci Cina, dengan rambut lurusnya meriap lebat namun lentur, begitu mudah tersibak liukan angin dan menari kala sang pemilik melangkah mengikuti setiap polah sikap tubuhnya. Ia setinggi seratus enam puluh, beratnya barangkali lima puluh kilo, seramping burungburung kuntul, dengan sepasang dada ranum merupakan kekayaannya yang tersembunyi, belum terjamah, dan roman muka cerianya sungguh kenes, bibirnya memagut setiap melempar kata. Ia bisa menaklukkan siapa pun, tampaknya, sebagaimana begitulah namanya. Maharani. Ratu segala ratu. Yang ketika tangannya tanpa ragu menggapai tangan lelaki di sampingnya, ...

TT: ... war sie so schön wie die Mädchen, die chinesischen Porzellan zierten, mit geradem, kräftigem, aber dennoch geschmeidig fließendem Haar, das jeder Windstoß anzuheben vermochte, das sie bei ihren Schritten tanzend umspielte und jeder ihrer Bewegungen bereitwillig folgte. Sie war etwa ein Meter sechzig groß, wog fünfzig Kilo, war so schlank wie ein Reiher, hatte als verborgenen Reichtum volle, unberührte Brüste, und auf ihrem Gesicht lag eine wirklich verführerische Fröhlichkeit, und schließlich waren da noch ihre Lippen, die bei jedem ihrer Worte den Blick auf sich zogen. Sie könnte jeden erobern, so schien es, wie auch ihr Name sagte: Maharani. Königin der Königinnen. Als sie, ohne zu zögern, nach der Hand des Mannes neben ihr griff, ...

Myth, in this context, is not limited to fiction, but rather a collective system of belief that reproduces and enforces gender inequality. In both descriptions of Maharani above, she is depicted as an aesthetic object, as a symbol of power, and as the Other. In both the ST and TT, Maharani's physical beauty is described in great detail. This further supports the idea that women are often valued based on their physical appearance and sensual appeal—what Simone de Beauvoir critiques as la femme-mythique: a woman reduced to symbol, not subject. Even though Maharani is described as actively grabbing the hand of a man, in general the description emphasizes on her physical beauty as opposed to the actions or thoughts. This places her in the position of an observed and admired object. The title "Maharani" places her as a symbol of power, although the power is merely symbolic and aesthetic instead of substantial. She is the "queen of queens", but there is no further explanation as to how she obtains or exerts her power. Both "Chinese vase" and

"Maharani" in the ST symbolizes exoticism and distinction. These further positions Maharani as the Other, as an intriguing figure, yet foreign and "not one of us".

The Portrayal of Maharani in the ST emphasizes more her aesthetics and the symbolic construction of power. In the context of social construction of women as beautiful and sensuous objects, Maharani is portrayed as an alluringly exotic character who is admired for her beauty and charm. The narrator describes her as someone who 'bisa menaklukkan siapa pun, tampaknya, sebagaimana begitulah Namanya. Maharani. Ratu segala ratu,' which translates to 'she could conquer anyone, it seemed, just like her name. Maharani. Queen of all queens.' This expression, which is based on cultural perception rather than actual agency, suggest symbolic authority through naming even though it is not supported by narrative act. Within patriarchal paradigm, the name "Maharani" is positioned as a legendary feminine ideal due to the name's associations with majesty and devotion. This aligns with Butler's notion of gender performativity (Morgenroth & Ryan, 2018), where femininity is not a fixed trait but a repeated set of linguistic performances—here through beauty, exoticism, and passive desirability. Maharani's identity is thus constructed discursively: she "performs" nobility, sensuality, and allure, but without autonomy or narrative voice.

The TT's portrayal of Maharani, on the other hand, is more centered on genuinely physical elements while preserving the mythological tone through the usage of the word 'Maharani,' which further heightens her exotic atmosphere. This translation choice, as Bassnett and Lefevere argue (Yan & Huang, 2014), demonstrates how translators function as cultural rewriters: preserving symbolic identity while recoding it for the target audience. In this case, the German TT retains the exotic mystique of Maharani, aligning with Venuti terms foreignization (Yonamine, 2022)—deliberately maintaining cultural otherness as a strategy to provoke interest or admiration. The notion of women as objects of beauty and symbolic power is essentially reproduced in both versions of Maharani, despite their differing descriptions. Maharani is still evaluated according to socially created standards of femininity, despite her attractive appearance. In both cultural contexts, she is positioned as a submissive yet appealing figure, symbolizing the way women are socially defined by their appearance.

Conversely, reality refers to the real conditions of women's lives that are often marked with oppressions and struggles. Women often become victims of domestic violence, imposed social and sexual limitations, and stigmatized. In the novel, a male character named Anwar Sadat has a non-committed long-term relationship with a woman, which shows how women are often stigmatized and receive social punishment for doing things that men do without consequences. This further shows inequality in the sexuality and morality norms upheld by a patriarchal society. This reality is described below.

ST: Si sulung Laila mewarisi kenakalan semacam ini sepenuhnya. Cantik dengan dada yang menyerobot menggoda, kulit selembut potongan keju, dengan wajah lembab dan sedikit keangkuhan pura-pura. Pada umur enam belas tahun, ia sudah terlalu montok sebagai anak sekolah, dada dan pahanya menjadi sasaran jahil teman lelaki dan gurunya, hingga suatu hari ayahnya menemukan gadis itu telah bunting. Anwar Sadat berlepotan cari dukun untuk mengeluarkan isi perutnya, sebab istrinya tak mau melakukan itu, dan sekolah tak mau menerima gadis bunting. Segera setelah ia keluar dari sekolah, Anwar Sadat segera menggiringnya ke hadapan penghulu, disandingkan dengan teman sekelas yang konon menanam benih, namun dua hari setelah perkawinannya, teman sekelas itu memergoki Laila di tempat tidur bersama lelaki lain.

Itu skandal kota paling menghebohkan, yang membikin Anwar Sadat sendiri memerah mukanya, dan Kasia menghilang beberapa hari ke rumah kerabat. Kedua lelaku itu, yang meniduri Laila dua hari setelah perkawinan dan si teman sekelas, kemudian hengkang meninggalkan dirinya. Sejak itu orang menyebutnya sebagai Si Janda dengan bisikan tambahan, "ia bisa dipakai".

TT: Die Älteste, Laila, hatte die Zügellosigkeit ihres Vaters zu einhundert Prozent geerbt. Sie war eine verführerische Schönheit, mit Brüsten, die alle Blicke auf sich zogen, einer käsezarten Haut, üppigen

Lippen, einem verheißungsvollen Gesicht und einer Prise gespielter Unnahbarkeit. Mit sechzehn Jahren war ihre Weiblichkeit für eine Schülerin zu sehr entwickelt, und ihre Brüste und Schenkel zogen die vorwitzigen Finger ihrer Mitschüler und Lehrer an, bis ihr Vater eines Tages herausfand, dass das Mädchen schwanger war. Anwar Sadat ließ nichts unversucht, bis er die Hilfe einer Heilerin fand, um das, was in ihrem Bauch war, zu entfernen, weil seine Frau hierzu nicht bereit war und die Schule ein schwangeres Mädchen nicht behielt. Als sie dann mit der Schule fertig war, hatte er die Tochter sogleich vor den Religionsbeamten gezerrt und mit dem Klassenkameraden verheiratet, der ihr damals allen Erklärungen nach seinen Samen eingepflanzt hatte; doch schon zwei Tage später hatte der junge Ehemann Laila mit einem anderen im Bett vorgefunden.

Wie kein anderer hatte dieser Skandal die Stadt erschüttert und Anwar Sadat mit einem roten Kopf hinterlassen und für einen Kurzaufenthalt Kasias bei Verwandten gesorgt. Beide Männer, sowohl Lailas späterer Bettgenosse wie auch der gehörnte Schulkamerad, verschwanden auf Nimmerwiedersehen. Seither bezeichneten die Leute sie als "die Geschiedene" mit dem geflüsterten Zusatz: "steht zur Verfügung".

The narration about Laila in both versions present a strong image of social construct on women, particularly concerning sexuality and stigma. According to de Beauvoir's concept of reality, it can be seen how this narration reproduces sexual norms and stigmas embedded within the patriarchal society. De Beauvoir argued that women is often positioned as the Other in a patriarchal society. They are constructed as a passive object, determined by the male gaze, and often punished for violations of established social norms. In the narration about Laila, several mechanisms that reproduce sexual norms and stigmas can be identified, including sexual objectification, rigid gender roles, language and stigma. Laila's body is depicted erotically and in great detail, focusing on the body parts considered sexually attractive. This places her as an object seen and valued according to her physical appearance. Laila's sexual behavior becomes the center of attention and is used to judge her character. She is punished and stigmatized for violating the purity and sacredness expected from a woman. Laila is considered solely responsible for her pregnancy, while her male partner is merely considered an accessory. This further supports the idea that women are solely responsible for their own purity and innocence, while men have a greater sexual independence. Even though Laila is a victim of sexual harassment and infidelity, she is the one to blame and be punished. This shows how victims of sexual harassment are often stigmatized and blame themselves. The nickname 'si Janda' (the Widow) and 'ia bisa dipakai' (she is (sexually) available) given to Laila shows how language is used to mark and exile women who violate social norms. The way people talk about Laila in whispers mark the shame and insult upon her. This creates a strong atmosphere of stigma around her.

Both versions of the same narration effectively reproduce the same sexual norms and stigma. In both the Indonesian and German versions, Laila is portrayed as a victim of sexual objectification, harsh moral judgment, and social exclusion. However, differences in diction and language styles create a different nuance between the two versions. For example, the expression, 'kulit selembut potongan keju' (skin as smooth as a cheese slice) in the ST carries a metaphor that combines sensuality with food imagery, subtly framing Laila's body as consumable. Meanwhile, the TT uses the phrase 'käsezarten Haut' (cheese-tender skin), where the adjective 'zart' (tender) in German evokes a direct tactile impression. This lexical choice, commonly found in sensual and commercial context in German, intensifies the objectification by emphasizing Laila's physical softness and vulnerability in more explicit terms.

Additionally, the TT introduces more intensified descriptors such as '*üppigen Lippen*' (full lips) and '*verführerische Schönheit*' (seductive beauty), which openly highlight sexual attractiveness. These word choices shift the tone from suggestive (as in the ST) to overt eroticism, reflecting what Venuti refers to as domestication strategy in translation: adapting the emotional and stylistic cues of a text to meet the reader expectations of the target culture—in this case, a more open expression of sensuality. In contrast, the ST's more metaphorical language aligns with Indonesian cultural norms surrounding modesty and female purity, where euphemism serves to veil direct reference to

sexuality. The contrast in diction illustrates Butler's theory of gender as performative, where language does not merely describe identity but constitutes it. Through translation, Laila's femininity is reconstructed in alignment with German gender discourses, which tend to permit more agency in the expression of sexuality—albeit still within the boundaries of objectification. Her identity, as constructed through translation, reflects a shift from being a stigmatized figure of shame to a symbol of sensuality, yet without real narrative power or autonomy.

Moreover, in line with de Beauvoir's feminist critique, both versions of the narrative reflect how women are constructed as the Other—viewed primarily through the lens of the male gaze, judged according to societal norms of purity, and punished for non-conformity. The term "Si Janda" (the widow) in ST and its whispered German equivalent "steht zur Verfügung" (is available) are not just labels but instruments of social exclusion and moral condemnation. These labels, as linguistic acts, serve to reduce Laila to her sexual status and deviant identity in the eyes of the community—highlighting the way language (as Butler and de Beauvoir both emphasize) becomes the medium of subjugation and control over female bodies.

The translation choices in *Tigermann* reflect what Bassnett and Lefevere define as the translator's role in rewriting cultural narratives, which often involves adapting gender representations to fit dominant ideologies in the target culture. In doing so, Laila's portrayal may appear more sensually empowered, but it remains tethered to patriarchal scripts. The changes do not liberate her character but rather recode her stigma through a new cultural lens.

2. Differences in Attitude towards Female Characters in ST and TT

The three main aspects underlined in attitude according to the appraisal theory include affect, judgment, and appreciation. In the appraisal analysis, we use the term appraising item to refer to a specific word or phrase that presents evaluation, while the term appraised refers to the evaluated persona or entity. In both ST and TT, we noted certain differences in the affective response to the female characters. For judgment, variations are found in the moral and ethical judgments. For appreciation, we inspect differences in judging and evaluation female characters. Overall, these differences impact on the reader's perception towards female identity in both versions of the text.

This particular citation presents variations in moral and ethical judgments in both ST and TT.

ST: Laila Si Janda sering di sana, menjadi sasaran bocah-bocah liar yang meraba tubuhnya di pojok warung dan ia hanya cekikikan, lain waktu jika ia sedang berbaik hati, Laila mau diajak pergi ke tempat tidur dengan cuma-cuma.

TT: Laila, die Geschiedene, war oft dort zu finden und war bei den wilden Jungs begehrt, die sie in der Ecke des Imbiss befummelten und hierfür ein amüsiertes Glucksen erbten, manchmal aber auch, wenn sie gutmütig war, gratis mit ihr ins Bett steigen durften.

In ST, the appraising item is shown through 'menjadi sasaran bocah-bocah liar' with 'Laila' as the appraised. The phrase 'menjadi sasaran bocah-bocah liar' (becoming the target of the wild boys) implies Laila's passivity and her lack of self-defense and autonomy. This further shows a negative evaluation of her ability to control a situation. The word 'sasaran' (target) metaphorically positions Laila as an object, not as an agent. This further diminishes her capacity and autonomy. The usage of the phrase 'bocah-bocah liar' further enhances the negative evaluation. The adjective 'liar' (wild) shows uncontrollable behavior that further highlights Laila's frailty and lack of capability. Using the judgment framework, it can be seen how the language in the above citation builds a negative evaluation towards Laila's capacity. She is depicted as a passive target, lacking in self-defense or refusal of the men. The usage of metaphor and it's scaling further intensify the negative evaluation, emphasizing her helplessness and frailty.

The appraising item 'menjadi sasaran bocah-bocah liar' is translated into 'war bei den wilden Jungs begehrt' (was desired by the wild boys) in the German version. This phrase in the target language

implies that Laila has a certain capability or competence, in this case, attractiveness and desirability. In this context, Laila's desirability among the wild boys is highlighted as a positive attribute. The usage of the word 'begehrt' (desired) switches the focus from Laila as a passive victim to an individual possessing a certain power or attractiveness. This positive assessment of Laila's capacity contrasts the negative depiction in the ST, in which Laila is seen as an undesirable object. The assessment of Laila through the phrase 'war bei den wilden Jungs begehrt' frames her in a positive perspective in terms of capacity. This further emphasizes her attractiveness and desirability, depicting her as a person admired and sought after, which adds a different dimension to her character compared to that in the ST. This positive assessment may influence the reader to view Laila in a more positive light, highlighting her agency and attraction.

The following citation shows variations in the affective response to female characters in both the ST and TT.

ST: Ia sering merasa sesak setiap Kasia datang, dan bersedih pada perempuan itu sewaktu si bidang pergi.

TT: Sobald Kasia bei ihr war, fühlte sie oft eine Enge in ihrer Brust, und die Frau tat ihr Leid, wenn sie wieder ging.

In the ST, the appraising item is found in the word 'bersedih' with 'Nuraeni' as the appraised. The word 'bersedih' (feel (felt) sad) refers to Nuraeni's emotional condition, particularly her own sadness and misery. The word 'bersedih' directly conveys an emotional reaction, expressing unhappiness and misery. This is an affective term that reveals Nuraeni's emotional trait. In this context, Nuraeni's sadness does not only represent a moment, but rather an ongoing emotional state, indicating the depth of the misery that affects her traits. This emotional judgment portrays Nuraeni as emotionally burdened and consistently unhappy, emphasizing her emotional vulnerability and turmoil. This assessment of Nuraeni through the word 'bersedih' frames her emotional condition in unhappiness dan misery. This underlines her continuous emotional misery and positions her as a character highly influenced by her circumstances.

In TT, the appraising item 'bersedih' is translated into 'tat ihr Leid' (felt sorry for her) which relates to the character's emotional reaction, particularly towards sadness or pressure. The phrase 'tat ihr Leid' directly conveys an emotional reaction indicating pity and sadness. The context and intensity of this phrase shows deep sadness and pity. The phrase 'tat ihr Leid' implies more than just a light sympathy; this shows a deep emotional response, which intensifies a negative emotion in the form of misery. The phrase 'tat ihr Leid' marks Nuraeni's emotional suffering and deep pity towards Kasia. This affective response highlights Nuraeni's sensitivity and emotional burden. The phrase 'Enge in ihrer Brust' (tightness in her chest) further strengthens the emotional pressure, physically manifesting unhappiness, and misery. The assessment of Nurani's character through the phrase 'tat ihr Leid' frames her as a character experiencing significant emotional pressure and pity. The usage of the phrase conveys strong unhappiness and misery, which indicates the depth of Nuraeni's emotional turmoil. This positive affective response underlines Nuraeni's empathy and her tendency to feel other people's suffering, further deepening her character.

The citation below presents an assessment towards Nuraeni's physical development as a teenager in both ST and TT.

ST: Nuraeni keluar dari kurungan air, menghanduki dirinya dan melilitkan handuk di tubuhnya, menutupi dada yang belum tumbuh benar dan sepotong pahanya, kembali menenteng ember berisi cucian yang hendak dijemur dan tangan lain mengapit piring dan gelas yang telah berkilau oleh bersih.

TT: Nuraeni trat aus ihrer Wasserumhüllung hervor, trocknete sich ab und wickelte das Handtuch so um ihren Körper, dass es sie von der nun langsam sprießenden Brust bis fast zum Knie bedeckte; in die eine Hand nahm sie den Eimer mit der gewaschenen Wäsche, die sie noch aufzuhängen hatte, während die andere Hand wieder nach der Wasserschüssel mit dem nun sauber glänzenden Geschirr griff.

In ST, the phrase 'dada yang belum tumbuh benar' ((her) chest that had not fully developed) shows euphemism, depicting her chest by referring to her adolescent physical condition. This depiction is negatively euphemistic, describing her developing chest using euphemistic language to evoke sympathy and innocence. The diction here is simple while largely ignoring physical details, which potentially emphasizes her youth and vulnerability.

The TT takes a different approach with the translation 'der nun langsam sprießenden Brust' (the now slowly sprouting chest). Here, the word 'sprießenden' (sprouting) shows a more explicit depiction that emphasizes physical change and growth. This choice of presenting growth has a more explicit and intensive focus. The phrase contains no euphemism compared to the ST, instead using a more direct and descriptive phrasing, which pays more attention to the more explicit foregrounding of her physical (im)maturity.

The contrasting lexical choices between 'belum tumbuh benar' and 'langsam sprießend' reflects different narrative nuances in each language, with the ST being more euphemistic and the TT more vehemently descriptive. This variation in translation shows how euphemistic nuances in characterization can potentially shape the reader's perception of female identity and adulthood in culturally specific manners. The German version may influence readers to witness Nuraeni's growth more explicitly, while the Indonesian version maintains her innocence and hesitation of her physical growth.

3. Influence of Target Cultural Norms to Reproduction of Female Identity in TT

In the German translation of *Lelaki Harimau*, cultural aspects play a significant role in the reproduction of female identity, particularly in the description of female characters. In both versions of the novel, the identity is often influenced by cultural norms, both coming from the source culture (Indonesian) to the target culture (German). An example of this is apparent in the physical descriptions of the female characters. In Indonesian, these descriptions are often softened and more euphemistic. In the TT, however, there is a tendency to more explicitly describe women's physique and emotions. This tendency may reflect the German cultural norms that are largely more liberal in discussing physical aspects and growth of the human body. For instance, the phrase 'dada yang belum tumbuh benar' is translated into 'die nun langsam sprießende Brust' which means 'slowly sprouting chest'. The translator chose the word 'sprießend' (sprouting or budding), which suggests a more explicit and dynamic growth. This further suggests that the physical changes are part of a gradually occurring natural process that needs to be emphasized.

These differences may be attributed to the German cultural norms that are generally more direct, straightforward, and individualistic in describing identity, including in terms of gender, character, and the female body. German cultural norms prioritize clarity and straightforwardness. These norms influence the process of translation, particularly when considering the topics that are considered sensitive or taboo in the Indonesian culture. In German culture, topics such as physical growth or gender roles are often more explicitly expressed, in line with gender open-mindedness and equality upheld by the German society.

In addition, the construction of female identity may be influence by gender stereotypes in the target culture. Translation functions to reinterpret female characters according to the expectations and stereotypes found in the target culture (Cocca, 2016). For instance, the description of a female character's traits may be adapted to be more suitable for the German perception of feminine power and independence. In the German context, women are often described as independent individuals with control of themselves. In a translated text, the narrative about a woman may be emphasized on these aspects, although risking inequivalence to the emphases in the ST.

Translation also plays a role in reshaping the female identity through lexical and grammatical choices that reflect attitudes towards gender. In the appraisal approach, attitude or evaluation of

female characters is reflected in different dictions from the source language to the target language. The translator, as a cultural mediator, indirectly conveys cultural values through diction and sentence constructions that may change the reader's perception towards female characters.

Overall, the German cultural norms in the German version of *Lelaki Harimau*, *Tigermann*, influence how the female identity is represented. The translation choices not only transfer the meaning, but also culturally reproduce the identity according to the German expectations and cultural norms, which in turn shape the way German readers understand the female characters in this novel.

D. Conclusion

The representation of identity of the female characters in the ST is depicted through the contrast between the traditional myth and the complex reality of women's lives. The myth of women in the Indonesian cultural context, - such as women being meek or passive—is mixed up with the reality in which the female characters have hidden power and courage. In the TT, the representation is often interpreted in an explicit, with a certain emphasis on the traits that display individual independence and strength. The German cultural norms that are more open to explicit discussions about the body and physical growth also contribute to the shift, allowing the German reader to see the female characters as more active and stronger figures.

The differences in judgment, appreciation, and affect towards female characters are found when comparing the ST with the TT. In the ST, women are often expressed in euphemisms or amelioration that reflects appreciation towards values of politeness and modesty. On the other hand, the TT uses more direct language, emphasizing physical attributes or emotions with higher intensity. This shows that translation can change the way female characters is accepted by the reader. In the German version, they look much stronger and empowered compared to the way they do in the original text.

The influence of the target cultural norms to the reproduction of female identity in the TT, which is realized through the emphasis of the target culture on openness and clarity in the depiction of gender identity that affects the reproduction of female identity in the TT. The TT tends to use more explicit vocabulary that gives an impression of firmness when depicting women's physical and emotional characteristics. This not only further shifts the reader's interpretation of the female characters, but also shifts the original nuances that the author would like to convey. The more direct lexical and grammatical choices create a narrative that may be more suitable for the gender equality norms that prevail in the target culture.

Overall, the translation of this novel shows that translation is always more than language transfer; it is also a transfer of cultural values. The representation of women in a novel when translated into another language, also brings about the influence of the cultural norms in the target culture, which in this case creates a female identity that is more empowered and more pronounced for the German reader.

E. Acknowledgements

The authors would like to express their sincere gratitude to Universitas Padjadjaran for funding this research through its internal grant scheme in the 2024 fiscal year. This article represents the first output of the funded research project.

References

- Addae, D., & Abakah, E. (2024). Unblurring the lines: Exploring the images of women in Ghanaian rap music. *Women's Studies International Forum*, 105, 102914. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.wsif.2024.102914
- Alshhre, A. M. (2024). Gender in revelations: Unraveling gendered struggles and revisiting the construction of cultural identity paradigms in Badriyah Al-Bishr's *Hend Wa al'askar* (2006). *Women's Studies International Forum*, 106, 102980. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.wsif.2024.102980
- Aubrey, J. S., & Frisby, C. M. (2011). Sexual objectification in music videos: A content analysis comparing gender and genre. *Mass Communication and Society*, *14*(4), 475–501. https://doi.org/10.1080/15205436.2010.513468
- Belsey, C., & Moore, J. (1997). The feminist reader: Essays in gender and the politics of literary criticism. Palgrave Macmillan.
- Benton, F. (2015). Getting a bad rap: Misogynistic themes in YouTube's top 100 most viewed pop and hip hop/rap music videos by artists' gender. *CLA Journal*, *3*, 11–35. https://www.researchgate.net/publication/322665800
- Bezdoode, Z. (2024). Kurdish women "bargaining with patriarchy:" The subversive woman in Ata Nahai's fiction. *Women's Studies International Forum*, 107, 102995. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.wsif.2024.102995
- Calogero, R. M. (2012). Objectification theory, self-objectification, and body image. In *Encyclopedia of body image and human appearance* (pp. 574–580). Elsevier. https://doi.org/10.1016/B978-0-12-384925-0.00091-2
- Caradeux, D. A., & Salom, L. G. (2013). Social representation of gender in award-winner short films in Spain. *Procedia Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 95, 126–135. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2013.10.631
- Cavallaro, D. (2001). Critical and cultural theory. A&C Black.
- Cocca, C. (2016). Superwomen: Gender, power, and representation. Bloomsbury Publishing USA.
- Darmapratiwi, K., & Pratiwi, D. P. E. (2024). Translation strategies of metaphor in *The Ballad of Never After* novel by Stephanie Garber. *Diglosia: Jurnal Kajian Bahasa, Sastra, dan Pengajarannya*, 7(1), 25–34. https://doi.org/10.30872/diglosia.v7i1.797
- Demissie, B. (2024). The representation of women in Ngũgĩ wa Thiong'o's *The River Between* and *A Grain of Wheat*: An ideological approach. *Social Sciences & Humanities Open*, *10*, 101004. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ssaho.2024.101004
- Fernández, L. J. T. (2022). Perpetuation of sexism through proverbs: The case of Martínez Kleiser's Refranero General Ideológico Español. *Language & Communication*, 83, 77–96. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.langcom.2022.01.003
- Finalia, C. (2022). Translation of physical aspects of women image from Indonesian into German: An appraisal analysis. *Metahumaniora*, 12(1). https://doi.org/10.24198/metahumaniora.v12i1.38154
- Finalia, C., Nababan, M. R., Santosa, R., & Djatmika, D. (2019). An appraisal theory approach to translation of body parts of women on the novel "Lelaki Harimau" by Eka Kurniawan. *Proceedings of the 2nd International Conference on Applied Linguistics (CONAPLIN 2018)*. https://doi.org/10.2991/conaplin-18.2019.9
- Fredrickson, B. L., & Roberts, T.-A. (1997). Objectification theory: Toward understanding women's lived experiences and mental health risks. *Psychology of Women Quarterly*, *21*(2), 173–206. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1471-6402.1997.tb00108.x
- Gustema, N. H. (2020). The translation of figurative languages in novel *Lelaki Harimau* by Eka Kurniawan. *MOZAIK HUMANIORA*, 20(1). https://doi.org/10.20473/mozaik.v20i1.16409
- Hornscheidt, A. (2003). Linguistic and public attitudes towards gender in Swedish. In *Gender across languages: The linguistic representation of women and men* (Vol. 1–3, pp. 339–368). J. Benjamins.

- Jackson, Y. A. (2004). Performativity identified. *Qualitative Inquiry*, 10(5). https://doi.org/10.1177/1077800403257673
- Kjellgren, A. (2023). The myth of Woman: Simone de Beauvoir and the anthropological discourse on myth. *History of European Ideas*, 49(8). https://doi.org/10.1080/01916599.2023.2198542
- Lear, A., & Taylor, K. (2023). "A woman 'in the snow among the clocks and instruments'": How Adrienne Rich reimagined the lives of women astronomers. *Acta Astronautica*, 207, 283–294. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.actaastro.2023.03.025
- Lombardo, E., & Meier, P. (2014). *The symbolic representation of gender*. Routledge. https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315552408
- Ma, Y., & Wang, B. (2016). A review of systemic functional translation studies from an interpersonal perspective. *International Forum of Teaching and Studies*, 12(1).
- Manfredi, M. (2011). Systemic functional linguistics as a tool for translation teaching: Towards a meaningful practice. *Systemic Functional Linguistics*, 49–62. http://hdl.handle.net/10077/9176
- Marais, K. (2018). Translation and development. In *The Routledge handbook of translation and politics*. https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315621289
- Martin, J. R., & Rose, D. (2007a). Working with discourse: Meaning beyond the clause. Continuum.
- Martin, J. R., & Rose, D. (2007b). Working with discourse. Meaning beyond the clause (2. Auflage ed.). Continuum.
- McRobbie, A. (2009). The aftermath of feminism: Gender, culture and social change. Sage Publications Ltd.
- Morgenroth, T., & Ryan, M. K. (2018). Gender trouble in social psychology: How can Butler's work inform experimental social psychologists' conceptualization of gender? *Frontiers in Psychology*, *9*. https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2018.01320
- Naganuma, M. (2008). A systemic functional approach to translation pedagogy in Japan. *Systemic Functional Linguistics in Use: Odense Working Papers in Language and Communication*, 29, 589–600.
- Pollali, C.-S., & Sidiropoulou, M. (2021). Identity formation and patriarchal voices in theatre translation. *Journal of Pragmatics*, 177, 97–108. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.pragma.2021.02.018
- Prayogo, M. D. (2023). Semiotic study: The meaning of women in the structure of social political movements in the 4 series of books *The Buru Island Tetralogy*. *Berumpun: International Journal of Social, Politics, and Humanities*, 5(2). https://doi.org/10.33019/berumpun.v6i1.71
- Rothman, B. K. (2016). Beyond mothers and fathers: Ideology in a patriarchal society. In *Mothering* (pp. 139–157). Routledge. https://www.taylorfrancis.com/chapters/edit/10.4324/9781315538891-9/beyond-mothers-fathers-ideology-patriarchal-society-barbara-katz-rothman
- Sari, N. P., & Rusdiarti, S. R. (2024). Konstruksi women empowerment dalam film *Memoria*. *Diglosia: Jurnal Kajian Bahasa, Sastra, dan Pengajarannya, 7*(2), 213–226. https://doi.org/10.30872/diglosia.v7i2.923
- Seidman, G. W. (1999). Gendered citizenship. *Gender & Society*, *13*(3), 287–307. https://doi.org/10.1177/089124399013003002
- Silva, M. O., Melo-Gomes, L. de, & Moro, M. M. (2024). From words to gender: Quantitative analysis of body part descriptions within literature in Portuguese. *Information Processing & Management*, 61(3), 103647. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ipm.2024.103647
- Sommers-Flanagan, R., Sommers-Fianagan, J., & Davis, B. (1993). What's happening on music television? A gender role content analysis I. *Sex Roles*, *28*(11).
- Sudarmaji, S., Santoso, I., & Mulyati, R. E. S. (2023). Analisis kesalahan hasil terjemahan mesin penerjemah teks bahasa Jerman ke dalam bahasa Indonesia. *Diglosia: Jurnal Kajian Bahasa, Sastra, dan Pengajarannya,* 6(2), 483–500. https://doi.org/10.30872/diglosia.v6i2.668
- Sugiharti, S., Nababan, M. R., Santosa, R., & Supana. (2022). The shift of politeness strategies of Javanese woman characters in the English translation of Indonesian novel 'Gadis Pantai'. *Eurasian Journal of Applied Linguistics*, 8(3). https://doi.org/10.32601/ejal.803008

- Suhadi, M. F. (2023). Sexual harassment in Eka Kurniawan's novel *Lelaki Harimau*. *International Journal of English and Applied Linguistics (IJEAL)*, 3(2). https://doi.org/10.47709/ijeal.v3i2.2760
- Thahara, Y., & Firdaus, A. (2014). Menilai kualitas terjemahan melalui teori appraisal: Studi kasus subtitle *X-Men Origins Wolverine*. In *The first international translation and interpretation symposium Jakarta: Universitas Indonesia* (pp. 324–329).
- Thoyyibah, A., & El Milal, D. F. (2023). Perception of "Beautiful" Indonesian women in the Eka Kurniawan's novel "Beauty is a Wound." *International Journal of English Learning and Applied Linguistics* (*IJELAL*), 3(2). https://doi.org/10.21111/ijelal.v3i2.10100
- Wang, B. (2014). Theme in translation: A systemic functional linguistic perspective. *International Journal of Comparative Literature and Translation Studies*, 2(4), 54–63. https://doi.org/10.7575/aiac.ijclts.v.2n.4p.54
- Wulandari, D. (2021). The representation of women in N.H.Dini's *Pada Sebuah Kapal*: The reflection of women cultural identity of the 1970s. *E3S Web of Conferences*, 317. https://doi.org/10.1051/e3sconf/202131703009
- Yan, C., & Huang, J. (2014). The culture turn in translation studies. *Open Journal of Modern Linguistics*, 4(4). https://doi.org/10.4236/ojml.2014.44041
- Yonamine, M. (2022). Domestication and foreignization in interlingual subtitling: A systematic review of contemporary research. *Translation and Interpreting*, 14(1). https://doi.org/10.12807/TI.114201.2022.A11
- Yulianeta, Y., Soeratno, S. C., & Kusharyanto, J. (2016). Representation of gender ideology in Indonesia novels: A study of *The Reformation Era Novel. Lingua Cultura*, 10(1). https://doi.org/10.21512/lc.v10i1.845



Open Access This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-ShareAlike 4.0 International License (https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/4.0/), which permits use, sharing, adaptation, distribution and reproduction in any medium or format as long as you give appropriate credit to the original author(s) and the source, provide a link to the Creative Commons license, and indicate if changes were made. If you remix, transform, or build upon the material, you must distribute your contributions under a CC BY-SA 4.0 license. The images or other third-party material in this work are included under the Creative Commons license, unless indicated otherwise in a credit line to the material.